

UN Kosovo Team
Scorecard on Performance Indicators for Gender Equity and
Women's Empowerment

Kosovo¹

March 2014

Prepared by Levent Koro

¹ All references to Kosovo are made in the context of the UN Security Council Resolution 1244 (1999)

Acknowledgements

Special thanks go out to all the staff of the UNKT and UN Organizations who provided invaluable and open assistance during the preparation of this report. In particular, I would like to express my gratitude to Joint Programme Coordinators and civil society organizations and the Agency for Gender Equality for their open and sincere feedback during the interviews.

Finally; special thanks go to Flora Macula from UN Women, and Nora Sahatciu, Yllka Plana and Shpend Qamili from UNKT for giving their unconditional support.

Levent Koro

Contents

ABBREVIATIONS	3
1. Introduction:	4
2. Methodology.....	4
3. Findings	5
Strengths:	5
Weaknesses:.....	6
Good Practices:.....	7
4. Follow-up.....	8
Annex 1: UNKT Performance Indicators for Gender Equality and Women’s Empowerment	11
Annex 2: Note the documents reviewed.....	27
Annex 3: The names and institutional positions of those interviewed.	28

ABBREVIATIONS

AGE	Agency for Gender Equality
AWP	Annual work plan
CCA	Common Country Analysis
CDP	Common Development Plan
CSO	Civil Society Organizations
ECLO	European Commission Liaison Office to Kosovo
EULEX	European Union Rule of Law Mission
S/GBV	Sexual/Gender Based Violence
GFP	Gender Focal Point
GM	Gender Mainstreaming
JP	Joint Programme
IOM	International Organization for Migration
MDGR	Millennium Development Goal Report
OHCHR	Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights
RC	Resident Coordinator
SGG	Security and Gender Group
UN	United Nations
UNDAF	United Nations Development Assistance Framework
UNICEF	United Nations Children Fund
UNDG	United Nations Development Group
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNFPA	United Nations Population Fund
UNHCR	United Nations High Commission on Refugees
UNKT	United Nations Country Team
UNMIK	United Nations Interim Administration Mission in Kosovo
UNOPS	United Nations Office for Project Services
WHO	World Health Organization

1. Introduction:

The United Nations (UN) Gender Scorecard is a standardized assessment of what UN organizations as a whole contribute to gender mainstreaming, and consequently to the promotion of gender equality at a local level. It enables the UN development system to assess how well gender has been mainstreamed against minimum standards pre-defined through the United Nations Development Assistance Framework (UNDAF) cycle, and allows for comparisons and learning between countries that have already undergone the gender scorecard exercise. The Scorecard focuses on the performance of the UN development system as a whole, rather than the achievements of any one agency. The assessment methodology measures gender mainstreaming in the UN common programming processes across eight dimensions. The method evaluates processes, rather than results, based on the understanding that the UN system is solely accountable for its processes, while results depend on the collective effort of numerous actors. The assessment tries to identify successes and the best practices toward fostering gender equality as well as the shortcomings and challenges within achieving gender equality. Finally, it outlines steps to facilitate a more comprehensive mainstreaming approach among UN and partner agencies.

Due to the legal and political ambiguity of the statehood status of Kosovo, the UN Development Group is not required to follow the fully fledged UNDAF framework. Instead, the UN Development Group in Kosovo developed the UN Common Development Plan (CDP) for the period of 2011-2015 with the aim of focusing and harmonizing the work of UN Organizations over the period of five years (2011-2015) built around four Strategic Themes: (i) Legislative and Policy Frameworks for Social Inclusion; (ii) Accountability for Delivering on Social Inclusion; (iii) Local Participation and Empowerment; and (iv) Environmental Health and Protection. The Scorecard was conducted in Kosovo in February – March 2014 toward the end of the CDP cycle. The timing was ideal for allowing findings and recommendations to feed into the design of the new CDP planning.

2. Methodology

The UNCT Gender Scorecard works within eight overarching areas of inquiry that encompass 22 indicators to present a holistic measure of gender mainstreaming processes. The eight dimensions centre on planning, programming, partnerships, UNCT capacities, decision-making, budgeting, monitoring and evaluation, and accountability. A local consultant worked during February and March 2014 to complete the Scorecard exercise in Kosovo with support from the UN Kosovo Team (UNKT). The consultant utilized both primary and secondary documents to inform the assessment such as the Common Development Plan (CDP) 2011-2015, M&E Framework for CDP, Kosovo Gender Equality Programme, Joint Programme documents and many others.² Following a review of key background documents, the consultant organized key informant interviews to obtain feedback from key players to critically assess the status of UN gender mainstreaming processes. Stakeholders offering input included key representatives from the UN, public institutions and civil society organisations (CSO).

² The list of documents reviewed are included in Annex 2

The research methodology enabled the consultant to review UN gender mainstreaming processes through the eyes of various players, thereby combining both insider and outsider perspectives in the assessment. The consultant assigned a numerical ranking to each indicator in accordance with the criteria prescribed by the scorecard. Details on ranking, evidence and explanations by indicator are included in Annex I. Average scores in each dimension were calculated by combining indicator scores and dividing by the total number of indicators. Findings and preliminary recommendations were presented for feedback and discussion to representatives from the UNKT. Presentations and discussions around scorecard results will hopefully facilitate a deeper discussion and understanding of identified strengths and weaknesses, and how to move forward in the next CDP cycle.

3. Findings

The results reveal that the UN development system in Kosovo is currently stronger with gender mainstreaming processes in the areas of planning, programming, decision-making and monitoring and evaluation, although there is some room for enhancement in these areas. On the other hand, there is more room for improvement in the areas of partnership, UN system capacities, and budgeting. A short description of key findings by dimension is highlighted below, starting with areas that scored more strongly and followed by areas that received a weaker score in the analysis.

Strengths:

Planning: The average score of 3.8 indicates an above average attention to gender mainstreaming in CDP planning processes however with some room improvement, since it is just below the minimum standard rating (4). More than half of outputs defined in CDP refer to tangible changes for rights holders or duty bearers which will lead to improvement in progress towards gender equality and women's empowerment. The CDP has been also successful in including gender sensitive indicators and baselines at the outcome level as well as at output level. However, scoring in the areas of 'planning' can be improved considerably if CDP had included in-depth analysis in the CDP of the ways in which gender inequality in different areas is reproduced. The current CDP also fell short of adopting an outcome designated for achieving gender equality and women empowerment.

Programming: The average score of 3.75 is very close to the minimum standard required for gender mainstreaming. This is due in large to the performance of the Joint Programmes on Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment. There are three fully funded joint programmes for promoting gender equality and women's empowerment (one on domestic and gender based violence, another on women, peace and security and the last one on women's and children's health in Kosovo). These programmes were jointly designed through thematic group meetings established with CDP although not all of them were developed consistent with the problems and challenges identified in the background analysis of CDP. In addition, adequate effort is being carried out to mainstream gender equality perspectives into other Joint Programmes largely due to UNDP and UN Women efforts. Finally UNKT has a strong track record in working cohesively to undertake joint advocacy and awareness raising initiatives and coordinating very

successfully with external partners through the Security and Gender Group (SGG)³ which is chaired by UN Women around issues such as Gender Based Violence (GBV- 16 days of no violence), marking the International Women's Day and human rights day etc.

Although the current CDP has included budgetary allocations to support the Kosovo Agency for Gender equality, women's NGOs and networks, and collection and analysis of sex-disaggregated data, and through joint programmes initiated a support to few municipalities and parliamentary commission on budget and finance on gender-responsive budgeting there is a space for more proactive role for UN Organizations working collectively towards gender equality and women's empowerment, advocating for it with the institutions, increasing their capacities in the gender mainstreaming, but also supporting the relevant decision making institutions to establish a donors group and successfully coordinate donors' support for the promotion of gender equality.

Decision-making: The average rating of 4 reflects the minimum standard required. The minutes of the meeting of Head of Agencies reveal that Gender equality programming and support issues included in at least half of the head of Agency meetings. Since the gender theme group has not been established, this dimension was rated as not applicable, and was not included in the scoring. However, it is important to mention that the UN Women representative is part of UN Head of Agencies group.

Monitoring and Evaluation: The average rating of 4 reflects the minimum standard required. The current CDP has a clearer monitoring and evaluation framework using sex-disaggregated data. One of the main strengths of the UNKT efforts is that it has been consistently contributing to building a better sex-disaggregated database. Data for gender sensitive indicators in the M&E Framework is also gathered, and the annual reporting from the Resident Coordinator covers the main gender related results. However, even in this dimension there is space for improvement. The UNKT has not carried out a separate gender evaluation or audit during this period of CDP.

Weaknesses:

Partnership: The average score of 3 reflects the need for improvement in this dimension which measures UNKT's partnership relations with the Kosovo gender machinery, women's/gender CSO, and marginalized women. Although some consultations were held with the Agency for Gender Equality during the planning process of the CDP, their role in contributing to the CDP outcomes is not explicit, and they did not feature prominently in the processes of reviewing the progress of the CDP. Similarly, certain women NGOs were part of the consultative process, but they all together felt they should be more involved in the CDP planning process, and not only be considered as implementing partners.

UNKT Capacities: The UNKT capacities dimension obtained the lowest score in the exercise (2.5), revealing the need for greater attention in this area. There is currently no UN Gender Theme Group in Kosovo. There has not been any review of the capacities of the UNKT staff to undertake gender mainstreaming, and the UNKT staff is not consistently trained on gender mainstreaming although UN Women, while preparing the current CDP, provided training to UNKT staff on Women's Human Rights

³ More information on SGG is provided in page 7 in the section about good practices.

and Gender Equality. The only sustainable mechanism available for capacity development is the induction training offered by the UNDP gender expert on gender (mainstreaming). However, this training is only offered to the newly hired staff or UNDP. Furthermore, a Gender expert roster exists with UN Women at the regional level (Bratislava), and it includes national experts along with international experts on gender. However, it has been found that it is not being utilized adequately by various UN Organizations.

Budgeting: The average score of 3 reflects the need for improvement. Certain UN Organizations have instituted the gender marker system, but UNKT have yet to fully consider the potential means for tracking gender equality expenditures. However, discussions have been initiated concerning the need to implement a budgeting system to track UNKT expenditures for gender equality programming. Although specific budget allocations existed to support Kosovo women's machinery and women's NGOs and networks and gender mainstreaming in CDP exercises, currently, there is no budget allocation for capacity building, nor gender mainstreaming activities neither budgetary allocations for gender equality pilot projects.

Quality control and accountability: Even if this dimension was rated 3, since Kosovo did not follow the proper UNDAF process, four out of five requirements foreseen were not applicable for Kosovo, and therefore this rating should be treated with reservation.

The findings presented below reflect the average score in each dimension. A full explanation and rating of each indicator is presented in Annex I.

Dimension	Average score
1 Planning	3.8
2 Programming	3.75
3 Partnerships	3.0
4 Policies and capacities	2.5
5 Decision-making	4.0
6 Budgeting	3.0
7 Monitoring and evaluation	4.0
8 Quality control and accountability	3.0

Good Practices:

As a good practice for gender mainstreaming, it will be useful to emphasize the establishment and operation of the Security and Gender Group (SGG). Due to the conflict that Kosovo experienced, integrating a gender perspective into the security sector as well as granting the equal and active participation of both women and men in shaping security policies and institutions is crucial for the stability of Kosovo. In order to promote, enhance, and coordinate efforts for gender equality in the security sector, and coordinate actions to effectively respond to women specific security threats, UN Women has established the SGG as an informal network of organizations which have diverse, but complementary mandates. Chaired by UN Women, the Group includes representatives of Kosovo institutions (AGE, the Political Advisor to the Deputy Prime Minister, Kosovo Police, Kosovo Security Forces), and both women's and international organizations such as Kosovo Women's Network, Kosovo Gender Studies Centre and UNMIK, UNDP, UNICEF, OHCHR, UN HABITAT, WHO, UNFPA,

UNHCR, UNOPS, IOM, ECLO, NATO, EULEX and OSCE.⁴ The group, since its establishment, has been very active, and has implemented a series of activities towards advancing women rights in Kosovo with a special focus on the area of gender and security. In particular, the SGG has been active in promoting information sharing and cooperation among key security stakeholders; providing gender expertise and evidence based data, and engaging in a series of advocacy and lobbying initiatives for the integration of gender perspectives in the security sector. Due to the absence of UN Gender Theme Group, the SGG somehow replaced and performed certain functions of this theme group. In addition to these activities, the biggest achievement of this group was in advocating and informing the Kosovo institution about adoption of the action plan for the implementation of the UNSCR 1325, which was very recently approved by the decision makers. During this process, OHCHR and UN Women provided more specific support to the Kosovo Office of the Prime Minister and ministries, especially in developing the detailed action plan as well as conducting appropriate costing analysis for the plan on UNSCR 1325. The most critical success factors of this group were the clear objectives, the right composition of the members, and working procedures of the SGG, as well as the high quality of secretariat functions which at the moment is provided by UN Women. Considering the multi-sectorial composition of the Group, UN Women, at first organized training in Security and Gender for all participants involved in the SGG to ensure that the group has a shared understanding of the gender and security related concepts and a clear orientation and objective of their work. The working procedures of the SGG were set to include structured meetings on a regular basis with clear agenda for discussion among members combined with occasional consultation meetings with much broader group of civil society representatives whereby decisions are taken by consensus. The working procedures also requires joint activities to be designed jointly and undertaken based on proper planning, which is also open for ad-hoc activities as agreed by the members.

4. Follow-up

Follow up actions are highlighted below in the matrix in order to address weak areas within those dimensions outlined by the scorecard in order to meet the minimum standards established by the UNDG.

Dimension	Average numerical rating	Main follow-up issues	Steps to be taken, including technical assistance needed, time-frame, allocation of responsibilities, and resources required
Planning	3.8	1.1.Include in-depth analysis in the CDP in the ways in which gender inequality in different areas is reproduced 1.2.Adopt an outcome designated for achieving	In order to ensure these aspects are covered in the next CDP design UNKT is recommended to: - Ensure in-house or external experts that will be involved in the drafting of the next CDP to have clear guidelines for GM

⁴ There are two sub groups established within SGG: one on Sexual gender based violence (SGBV) co-chaired by OHCHR and Kvinna till Kvinna – NGO and another on Domestic Violence which is co-chaired by OSCE and UNDP.

		gender equality and women's empowerment	for UNDAF - Have a screening process for GM in the early stage of the drafting process using the checklist of this guide - Ask for UNDG to provide a review on GM Timing: The preparations for new CDP will start this year. Responsibility: UNKT Resources: Most resources will be in-house.
Programmi ng	3.75	2.1. There is no screening mechanism in place which assesses whether gender perspectives are adequately covered in the JP. 2.2. There is a space for a more proactive role for UN Organizations working collectively towards gender equality and women's empowerment,	2.1. Establish a screening mechanism possibly within the gender theme group to assess GM in JPs (in drafting, implementations and reporting) Timing: As soon as possible. Responsibility: Heads of Agencies or Gender Theme group once it is established Resources: Most resources will be in-house. 2.2. UNKT is recommended to discuss these issues during formulation of the next CDP outcome and outputs. Timing: The preparations for the new CDP will start this year. Responsibility: UNKT Resources: Most resources will be in-house.
UNKT capacities	2.5	There is no UN Gender Theme Group in Kosovo. There has not been any review of the capacities of the UNKT staff to undertake gender mainstreaming, and UNKT staff is not consistently trained on gender	Establish an UNKT gender theme group chaired by Un Women, or a joint theme group on human rights and gender, co-chaired by UN Women and OHCHR initially to advice RC and UNKT towards achieving greater gender mainstreaming performance, including reviewing UNKT staff capacities as well as to

		mainstreaming	institute training programs on GM as well as responsible for developing a new (joint) programmes on gender equality and women's empowerment in the next CDP cycle. Timing: As soon as possible. Responsibility: Heads of Agencies Resources: Most resources will be in house.
M & E	4	Carry out a separate gender evaluation or audit	Since UNKT is approaching the end of this CDP cycle, it is recommended to include a separate gender evaluation or audit in the next CDP cycle. Timing: The next CDP cycle. Responsibility: UNKT Resources: A consultancy charge may be required for the gender evaluation or audit.
Partnership	3	Women NGOs feel they should be more involved in the CDP planning process. Clarify better the role of Agency for Gender Equality in contributing to UNDAF outcomes	In order to ensure these aspects are covered in the next CDP design; UNKT is recommended to: - Involve more women NGOs in the CDP planning process - Involve AGE more strategically in order to define their role in contributing to UNDAF outcomes
Budgeting	3	No budgeting system that tracks gender equality expenditures	It is recommended that UNKT meet this requirement in the next CDP, and then use the data gathered to monitor expenditures and address imbalances, if any, in resource allocation. Timing: The next CDP cycle. Responsibility: RC Resources: A consultancy charge may be required for GBB

Annex 1: UNKT Performance Indicators for Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment

UNKT Performance Indicators for Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment

Rating

- 5 = exceeds minimum standards
- 4 = meets minimum standards
- 3 = Needs improvement
- 2 = Inadequate
- 1 = Missing
- 0 = not applicable

Dimensions	Definition	Rating Include reviewer comments and evidence base
1. PLANNING (CCA/UNDAFs)⁵		
1.a - Adequate UNCT review of country context related to gender equality and women's empowerment Source: UNDG Guidance⁶	Exceeds minimum standards - Includes an in-depth evidence-based analysis of the ways in which gender inequality is reproduced, including the influence of gender relations, roles, status, inequalities and discrimination in legislation and policies, access to and control of resources. - The analysis notes links to national legal frameworks, relevant to the promotion of gender equality and women's empowerment, and specific measures for follow up to CEDAW reports and CEDAW Committee concluding comments. - All data is sex-disaggregated, or there is a specific reason noted for not disaggregating by sex. - Critical capacity gaps are identified in the area of the promotion of gender equality. Meets minimum standards - Includes an analysis of the ways in which gender inequality is reproduced, including the influence of	Needs improvement (Score: 3) UNKT has made the following attempts to mainstream gender in key planning documents: i) Use of disaggregated outcomes by gender on employment, business ownership, property, decision making opportunities, and gender based violence ii) Reference to GDI (gender related development index) reflecting the gender inequality status; iii) Reference to legislative framework on gender equality (law on gender equality and law on anti-discrimination) However, there is no in-depth analysis in the CDP of the ways in which gender inequality in different areas is reproduced, nor of the

⁵ To be completed once during the CCA/UNDAF period. Countries that don't have a CCA/UNDAF, including conflict/post conflict/crisis countries, should apply these indicators and standards to any other common country planning and programming that the UNCT agrees on. This process will be reviewed on an ongoing basis by the Development Operations Coordination Office.

⁶ Key source documents are provided as an Annex to the Users' Guide.

Dimensions	Definition	Rating Include reviewer comments and evidence base
	gender relations, roles, status, inequalities and discrimination in access to and control of resources. • The analysis notes links to national legal framework relevant to the promotion of gender equality and women's empowerment, and includes reference to CEDAW reports and concluding comments. • All data is sex-disaggregated, or there is a specific reason noted for not disaggregating by sex. Needs improvement Any two of the above three areas (under <i>Meets minimum standards</i>) are met. Inadequate Any one of the above three areas (under <i>Meets minimum standards</i>) is met. Missing Not applicable	reference to the Kosovo Program for Gender Equality (2008-2013). For this reason the, “meets minimum standards” rating was not given. Evidence base: Common Development Plan (CDP) (2011-2015)
1.b - Gender equality and women's empowerment in UNDAF outcomes Source: UNDG Guidance	Exceeds minimum standard More than one outcome clearly articulates how gender equality and women's empowerment will be promoted. Meets minimum standard One outcome clearly articulates how gender equality will be promoted. Needs improvement One outcome includes reference to gender, but does not clearly articulate how gender equality will be promoted. Inadequate Gender equality and women's empowerment are given ‘token’ or minimal attention. Missing Not applicable	Needs improvement (Score: 3) Most of the outcome statements include <u>hidden</u> reference to gender equality since these outcomes refer to institutions that are more responsive to right holders, producing stronger policies and legislative framework on social inclusion or civil society that is increasingly influencing the governance of the public services. However, none of them clearly articulates (explicitly) how gender equality will be promoted. Evidence base: CDP (2011-2015) and CDP Revised Outcomes paper for 2013 -2015
1.c - Gender equality and women's empowerment in UNDAF outputs	Exceeds minimum standard At least one half of outputs clearly articulate tangible changes for rights holders and duty bearers which will lead to improvements in progress toward gender equality and women's empowerment.	Exceeds minimum standard (Score: 5) More than half of the outputs (9 outputs out of 15 in total) clearly articulate tangible changes for the rights holders or duty bearers, which will lead to

Dimensions	Definition	Rating Include reviewer comments and evidence base
Source: undg Guidance	Meets minimum standard Between one third and one half of outputs clearly articulate tangible changes for rights holders and duty bearers which will lead to improved gender equality. Needs improvement Less than one third of outputs clearly articulate tangible changes for rights holders and duty bearers which will lead to improved gender equality. Inadequate Outputs refer to gender equality or women in passing, but with no logical connection to changes in gender equality. Missing Not applicable	improvement in the progress towards gender equality and women's empowerment Evidence base: CDP (2011-2015) and CDP revised outcomes for 2013 -2015
1.d - Indicators to track UNDAF results are gender-sensitive Source: undg Guidance	Exceeds minimum standard At least one indicator at outcome level, and one half of indicators at output level, are gender sensitive, and will adequately track progress towards gender equality results. Meets minimum standard At least one indicator at outcome level, and between one third and one half of indicators at output level, are gender sensitive, and will adequately track progress towards gender equality results. Needs improvement No gender-sensitive indicators at outcome level and less than one third of indicators at output level are gender sensitive. Inadequate Token reference to gender equality or women in indicators. Missing Not applicable	Meets minimum standard (Score: 4) The Monitoring and Evaluation matrix does include gender sensitive indicators at the outcome level well as the output level. Four indicators at outcome level and about one third of indicators (9 out of 28) at the output level are gender sensitive, and will adequately track progress towards gender equality results Evidence Base: CDP Result Matrix And Monitoring and Evaluation Framework for CDP

Dimensions	Definition	Rating Include reviewer comments and evidence base
1.e - Baselines are gender-sensitive Source: UNDG Guidance	Meets minimum standard⁷ All data is sex-disaggregated, or there is a specific reason noted for not disaggregating by sex. Needs improvement Some data is sex-disaggregated but sex-disaggregation is not systematic. Inadequate There is token sex-disaggregation of data. Missing Not applicable	Meets minimum standard (Score: 4) In the M&E Matrix all the data that is possible to disaggregate by gender is disaggregated. The data that is not disaggregated is related to oversight, environment, and disaster risk management issues. Evidence Base: CDP Result Matrix And Monitoring and Evaluation Framework for CDP
2. PROGRAMMING		
2.a - Gender perspectives are adequately reflected in joint programming⁸ Source: ECOSOC 1997, 2004, 2005, 2006, TCPR 2007, World Summit Outcome 2005	Exceeds minimum standard - Promoting gender equality and women's empowerment is reflected in long-term programming consistent with the opportunities and challenges identified in the UNCT's background analysis of gender inequality and women's rights situation (e.g., in CCA/UNDAFs, MDG report, etc.). - UNCT joint initiative(s) (e.g., advocacy and other initiatives) in support of gender equality and women's empowerment exist. Meets minimum standard - There are detailed, practical and adequately funded programmes addressing the problems and challenges identified in the background analysis of gender inequality and women's rights situation. - UNCT joint initiative(s) in support of gender equality exist. Needs improvement Meets either one of the two areas above (under <i>Meets minimum standard</i>). Inadequate Token reference to gender equality in programming.	Meets minimum standard (Score: 4) The UNKT joint programme on domestic violence (with UNW, UNFPA, UNICEF, OHRCH) in Kosovo was prepared and adequately funded consistent with the problems and challenges identified in the background analysis on gender inequality and the situation regarding women's rights. In addition, a joint programme on Women, Peace and Security (UN Women, UNDP and EU) was launched, adequately funded and implemented, aiming to ensure the greater participation of women in peace building and post-conflict planning. Finally, a joint programme on Women and Children's Health (UNFPA, UNICEF, WHO) was launched, adequately funded and implemented aiming to improve the condition of women and children's health in Kosovo. These programmes were jointly designed through thematic group meetings, which were established with CDP. Moreover, many other joint initiatives have been successfully conducted. It is important to highlight the joint initiative which supported the drafting of an action plan for the

⁷ It is not possible to exceed the minimum standard in this case, because the indicator refers to an absolute value (all data).

⁸ For background information and guidance on joint programming and joint programmes, see <http://www.undg.org/index.cfm?P=237>

Dimensions	Definition	Rating Include reviewer comments and evidence base
	Missing Not applicable	implementation of the UN Resolution 1325, women, peace and security, as well as 16 days of activism to end violence. However, since many other problems and challenges identified in the background analysis in relation to gender equality were not reflected in the joint programming, the “exceeds minimum standards’ rating was not given. Evidence: CDP (2011-2015) and Joint Programmes, Action Plan for implementation of UN Resolution 1325; interviews with Joint Project Coordinators
2.b – Joint programmes Source: UNDG Guidance	Exceeds minimum standard Key national gender equality and women’s empowerment priorities are being addressed through a Joint Programme on gender equality, and through mainstreaming gender equality into other Joint Programmes. Meets minimum standard A Joint Programme on promoting gender equality and women’s empowerment is in place, and work is in progress to mainstream gender into other Joint Programmes. Needs improvement Joint Programme on promoting gender equality and women’s empowerment being formulated, and limited mainstreaming in other Joint Programmes. Inadequate No Joint Programme on promoting gender equality and women’s empowerment being formulated, and limited attention to gender in Joint Programmes Missing Not applicable	Meets minimum standard (Score: 4) There have been serious efforts made to mainstream gender equality perspectives into other Joint Programmes. They have adequately incorporated gender perspectives into their programming documents: i) Joint programme on Diaspora Engagement in Economic Development includes gender sensitive financial literacy components ii) Joint programme on Building a better future for citizens of Fushe Kosove/Kosovo Polje, and Obiliq/Obilic promotes gender equitable employment opportunities as well as gender sensitive services for better health, environmental and educational choices iii) The joint programme on Parliamentary Development for Social Policies successfully incorporated gender dimensions in reviewing, monitoring and overseeing the progress towards achieving the MDGs Furthermore, within the UNDP, there is a screening mechanism in place which assesses whether gender perspectives are adequately covered in the concept notes, project briefs, project documents, and progress reports. However, this mechanism applies only to joint programmes where UNDP is involved, and

Dimensions	Definition	Rating Include reviewer comments and evidence base
		covers those activities that fall under the responsibility of UNDP only. Furthermore, since many other Kosovo gender equality and women's empowerment priorities defined in the "Kosovo Programme for Gender Equality (2008-2013) were not being addressed by Joint Programmes the 'exceeds minimum standards' rating was not given. Evidence: The Kosovo Programme for Gender Equity (2008 -2013) and Joint Programmes; Interviews with gender focal points of UN Agencies and with Joint Programme Coordinators
2.c - UNCT support for national priorities related to gender equality and women's empowerment Source: TCPR 2007	Exceeds minimum standard UNDAF budgetary allocations support implementation of national gender equality legal frameworks, including: - National Plan of Action on Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment. - Implementation of CEDAW, and follow-up to CEDAW Committee concluding comments. - Collection and analysis of sex-disaggregated data at the national level. - gender mainstreaming in ministries other than the women's machinery. Meets minimum standard Meets any three of the above. Needs improvement Meets any two of the above. Inadequate Meets one of the above. Missing Not applicable	Meets minimum standard (Score: 4) CDP budgetary allocations supported: - Agency for Gender Equality (AGE) for implementation of certain components in the Kosovo Program on Gender Equality such as on domestic violence and violence against women, action plan for implementation of UNSR 1325 etc. - Kosovo Agency for Statistics (KAS) and other institutions to generate approximately 30 reports disaggregated by gender and key vulnerable groups - Gender mainstreaming in the Kosovo Judicial Institute, the Kosovo Security Force, and the Kosovo Police. However, no support was provided to line ministries in regard to gender mainstreaming; therefore, the "exceeds minimum standards" rating was not given. Since Kosovo is not a member of the UN, it is not eligible to report to CEDAW committee; therefore this indicator is not applicable to Kosovo. Evidence: Interviews with gender focal points of UN Agencies, Joint Program Coordinators and the Agency for Gender Equality
2.d - UNCT support	Exceeds minimum standard	Not Applicable (Score: 0)

Dimensions	Definition	Rating Include reviewer comments and evidence base
to gender mainstreaming in programme based approaches Source: TCPR 2007	• Capacity development provided to relevant government ministries for mainstreaming gender in Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers or equivalent. • Capacity development provided to relevant government ministries for mainstreaming gender in General Budget Support programming. • Capacity development provided to relevant government ministries for mainstreaming gender in Sector Wide Approaches and/or National Development Plans. Meets minimum standard Meets any two of the above. Needs improvement Meets any one of the above. Inadequate Token attention to gender mainstreaming in programme based approaches. Missing Not applicable	Kosovo does not have PRPS, general budget support programming or SWAPs.
2.e - UNCT support to gender mainstreaming in aid effectiveness processes Source: TCPR 2007	Exceeds minimum standard • Gender-responsive budgeting (GRB) is promoted in the Ministry of Finance and other key ministries. • UNCT takes lead role in strengthening the Government's ability to coordinate donor support to promote gender equality. • UNCT supports monitoring and evaluation of gender mainstreaming in National Development Plans, Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers or equivalent, General Budget Support programming, and Sector Wide Approaches. Meets minimum standard Meets any two of the above. Needs improvement Meets one of the above. Inadequate Token attention to gender mainstreaming in aid effectiveness processes. Missing	Needs improvement (Score: 3) UN Organizations have initiated a support to few municipalities and parliamentary commission on budget and finance on gender-responsive budgeting through joint programmes. Being a very recent activity and a new concept for Kosovo institutions it takes more time for concrete results. However, the Ministry of Finance has not yet been a part of this assistance. Similarly, there is no coordination for donors' support on the promotion of gender equality, but UNKT can play a more active role in supporting the government to establish, as well as successfully operate such a function. Evidence: Interviews with gender focal points of UN Agencies, Joint Programme Coordinators, and the Agency for Gender Equality

Dimensions	Definition	Rating Include reviewer comments and evidence base
	Not applicable	
3. PARTNERSHIPS		
3.a - Involvement of National Machineries for Women / Gender Equality and women's departments at the sub-national level⁹ Source: UNDG Guidance	Exceeds minimum standard Women's machinery/department participates fully in: • Consultations about CCA/UNDAF planning (e.g. the prioritization retreat). • Development of UNDAF outcomes, outputs and indicators. • As key informants/stakeholders in the monitoring and evaluation of UNDAF results. Full participation means that the women's machinery/department is present at meetings, is involved in decision-making, and that recommendations made are followed-up and there is involvement at the implementation level. • Role of women's machinery in supporting achievement of UNDAF outcomes clearly defined. Meets minimum standard • Women's machinery/department participates fully in CCA/UNDAF consultations. • Role of women's machinery/department in supporting achievement of UNDAF outcomes clearly defined. Needs improvement • Women's machinery/department participates fully in one of the above (under <i>Meets minimum standard</i>). Inadequate Token participation by women's machinery/department. Missing Not applicable	Needs improvement (Score: 3) The Kosovo Agency for Gender Equality (AGE) participated fully in the CDP elaboration process and planning exercises; including the participation of planning the workshops. However, discussions with AGE reveal that their role was not clearly defined regarding how they will support the achievement of the CDP outcomes, and for this reason the rating "meets minimum standards" was not given. Evidence: Interviews with UN Agencies, and the Agency for Gender Equality
3.b - Involvement of women's NGOs and networks¹⁰	Exceeds minimum standard Women's NGOs and networks participate fully in: • Consultations around CCA/UNDAF planning (e.g. the prioritization retreat).	Needs improvement (Score: 3) UNKT has very successfully incorporated Women's NGOs and networks in the planning and implementation <u>of the joint programmes</u>.

⁹ To be completed once during the CCA/UNDAF process.

¹⁰ To be completed once during the CCA/UNDAF process.

Dimensions	Definition	Rating Include reviewer comments and evidence base
Source: UNDG Guidance	• Development of UNDAF outcomes, outputs and indicators. • Monitoring and evaluation of UNDAF results. Full participation means that women NGOs and network representatives are present at meetings, involved in decision-making, that recommendations made are followed-up, and that they are also involved at the implementation level. • Role of women's NGOs and networks in supporting achievement of UNDAF outcomes clearly defined. Meets minimum standard • Women's NGOs and networks participate fully in CCA/UNDAF consultations. • Role of women's NGOs and networks in supporting achievement of UNDAF outcomes clearly defined. Needs improvement • Women's NGOs and networks participate fully in one of the above (under <i>Meets minimum standard</i>) Inadequate Token participation by women's NGOs and networks. Missing Not applicable	and there are very good examples of this kind. Cooperation with MEDIKA NGO was crucial in the work related to victims of gender-based violence, particularly rape and other forms of sexual abuse, in armed conflict. They also play a very central role in supporting the achievement of CDP outputs. Now, UNKT is planning to capitalize on this expertise of collaboration with NGOs in joint programmes and apply strategically to the next phase CDP planning, development of outcomes, outputs and indicators as well as in the monitoring and evaluation of CDP results. Evidence: Interviews with UN Agencies, and Women's NGOs and networks
3.c - Women from excluded groups included as programme partners and beneficiaries in key UNCT initiatives Source: UNDG Guidance	Exceeds minimum standard • Women from excluded groups and their capacities and livelihoods strategies, clearly identified in UNCT country level analysis. • UNCT proactively involves women from excluded groups in planning, implementation, decision-making, and monitoring and evaluation. • Women from excluded groups are participants and beneficiaries in key UNCT initiatives, e.g. in UNDAF outcomes and outputs. Meets minimum standard • Women from excluded groups clearly identified in UNCT country level analysis. • Women from excluded groups are participants and beneficiaries in key UNCT activities, e.g. in UNDAF outcomes and outputs.	Needs improvement (Score: 3) Women from excluded groups are beneficiaries in key CDP outcomes and outputs. Women from Roma, Askali and Egyptian (RAE), Kosovo Serbs or women victims of sexual abuse can be given as examples. They were also involved in the development of joint programmes. However, their capacities and livelihoods strategy was not identified at an adequate level in the CDP background analysis. In other words, there was not a great deal of analysis on different groups of women in the CDP background analysis; nor has UNKT been proactively involved with women from excluded groups in

Dimensions	Definition	Rating Include reviewer comments and evidence base
	Needs improvement Meets one of the above (under <i>Meets minimum standard</i>). Inadequate Token involvement of women from excluded groups. Missing Not applicable	planning and the M&E of CDP. Evidence: CDP, interviews with civil society organizations and UN Agencies
4. UNCT CAPACITIES		
4.a - Multi-stakeholder Gender Theme Group is effective Source: TCPR 2007	Exceeds minimum standard - Gender Theme Group adequately resourced, and resourced equally to other Theme Groups. - All key stakeholders participate (e.g. national partners, Bretton Woods institutions, regional banks, civil society, trades unions, employer organizations, the private sector, donors, and international NGOs). - Gender Theme Group recommendations taken into account in preparation of CCA/UNDAF. - Gender Theme Group has clear terms of reference with membership of staff at decision making levels and clear accountability as a group. Meets minimum standard - Gender Theme Group adequately resourced. - Gender Theme Group recommendations taken into account in preparation of CCA/UNDAF. - Gender Theme Group has clear terms of reference. Needs improvement Meets any two of the above (under <i>Meets minimum standard</i>). Inadequate Meets any one of the above (under <i>Meets minimum standard</i>). Missing Not applicable	Not Applicable (Score: 0) There is currently no UN Gender Theme Group in Kosovo. However, in order to promote, enhance, and coordinate efforts for gender equality in the security sector, and coordinate actions to effectively respond to women specific security threats, UN Women has established the Security and Gender Group (SGG) as an informal network of organizations. The SGG has two other sub groups: one of Sexual Gender Based Violence (SGBV) co-chaired by OHCHR and Kvinna till Kvinna – NGO and another on Domestic Violence co-chaired by OSCE and UNDP. The group, since its establishment, has been very active, and has implemented a series of activities towards advancing women rights in Kosovo with a special focus on the area of gender and security. Due to the absence of UN Gender Theme Group, the SGG somehow replaced and performed certain functions of this theme group.
4.b - Capacity assessment and development of UNCTs in gender equality and	Exceeds minimum standard Resident Coordinator systematically promotes, monitors, and reports on capacity assessment and development activities related to gender equality and women's empowerment.	Inadequate (Score: 2) There has not been any review of the capacity of the UNKT staff in undertaking gender mainstreaming, and UNKT staff are not

Dimensions	Definition	Rating Include reviewer comments and evidence base
women's empowerment programming Source: ECOSOC 2006	• Regular review of capacity of UNCT to undertake gender mainstreaming (e.g. once every one or two years). • The impact of the gender component of existing training programmes regularly reviewed, and revised based on the review. • Training on gender mainstreaming takes place for all UNCT staff (one day every six months for new staff for first year, minimum of one day of training once every year after this). • Gender specialists and gender focal points receive specific training (minimum four days of training per year on gender equality and women's empowerment programming). Meets minimum standard • Resident Coordinator systematically promotes, monitors and reports on capacity development activities related to gender equality and women's empowerment • Regular review of capacity of UNCT to undertake gender mainstreaming (e.g. once every two or three years). • Training on gender mainstreaming takes place for all UNCT staff (one day every six months for new staff for first year, minimum of one day of training once every two years after this). • Gender specialists and gender focal points receive specific training (minimum two days of training a year on gender equality and women's empowerment programming). Needs improvement Any two of the above (under <i>Meets minimum standard</i>) are met. Inadequate Token attention to capacity development of UNCTs in gender mainstreaming. Missing Not applicable	consistently trained in gender mainstreaming although UN Women, while preparing the current CDP, provided training to UNKT staff on Women's Human Rights and Gender Equality. The only sustainable mechanism available for capacity development is the induction training offered by UNDP gender expert in gender (mainstreaming). However, this training is only offered to the newly hired staff or UNDP. Some agencies do require their staff to undertake online training. However, interviews reveal that this may not be the right instrument in order to increase capacities on gender mainstreaming. Evidence: Interviews with gender focal points and experts of UN Agencies
4.c - Gender expert roster with national, regional and international expertise used by UNCT	Exceeds minimum standard • Gender expert roster exists, is regularly updated and includes national, regional and international experts. • Experts participate in key UNCT activities (e.g.	Needs improvement (Score: 3) A gender expert roster exists at the regional level (Bratislava), and includes national experts, along with international experts on gender. However, it

Dimensions	Definition	Rating Include reviewer comments and evidence base
members¹¹ Source: ECOSOC 2006	UNDAF planning, development of Joint Programmes on gender equality and women's empowerment). • Roster used on a regular basis by UN agencies (dependent on size of UN country programme). Meets minimum standard • Gender expert roster exists. • Roster used on a regular basis by some UN agencies (dependent on size of UN country programme). Needs improvement Roster in place but not updated or utilised. Inadequate No roster exists. Missing Not applicable	has not being utilized by various UN Organizations. This is the reason why the rating “meets minimum standard” is not given. Evidence: Interviews with UN Agencies
5. DECISION-MAKING		
5.a - Gender Theme Group coordinator is part of UNCT Heads of Agency group Source: TCPR 2007	Yes/No	No Not Applicable (Score: 0)
5.b - UNCT Heads of Agency meetings regularly take up gender equality programming and support issues Source: TCPR 2007	Exceeds minimum standard • Gender equality programming and support issues included in 75% of Heads of Agency meetings. • Decisions related to gender equality programming and support issues are followed through. Meets minimum standard • Gender equality programming and support issues are included in 50% of Heads of Agency meetings. • Decisions related to gender equality programming and support issues are followed through. Needs improvement Heads of Agency meetings occasionally include gender equality programming on their agenda.	Meets minimum standard (Score: 4) Gender equality programming and support issues included in at least half of Heads of Agency meetings. These issues have also been properly followed up through and monitored in different meetings. Evidence: minutes from Heads of Agency meetings and interviews with UN Agencies.

¹¹The roster can be maintained at national or regional levels.

Dimensions	Definition	Rating Include reviewer comments and evidence base
	Inadequate Token attention to gender equality programming and support issues. Missing Not applicable	
6. BUDGETING		
6.a - UNCT Gender responsive budgeting system instituted Source: ECOSOC 2005	Exceeds minimum standard The UNCT has implemented a budgeting system that tracks UNCT expenditures for gender equality programming, as a means of ensuring adequate resource allocation for promoting gender equality. Meets minimum standard The UNCT has clear plans for implementing a budgeting system to track UNCT expenditures for gender equality programming, with timelines for completion of the plan noted. Needs improvement Discussions ongoing concerning the need to implement a budgeting system to track UNCT expenditures for gender equality programming. Inadequate The issue of implementing a budgeting system to track UNCT expenditures for gender equality programming has been raised, but a decision was taken not to proceed with this. Missing Not applicable	Needs improvement (Score: 3) A budgeting system which tracks specific UNKT expenditures for gender equality programming does not exist. At the moment, inside the UNKT, discussions are happening concerning the need to implement a budgeting system to track UNKT expenditures for gender equality programming. Having said that it is important to emphasize that it is possible to track joint programme expenditures on women's empowerment. Evidence: CDP, Annual work Plan of CDP, Interviews with UN Agencies
6.b - Specific budgets allocated to stimulate stronger programming on gender equality and women's empowerment Source: ECOSOC 2005	Exceeds minimum standard Specific budgets to strengthen UNCT support for gender equality and women's empowerment located for: • Capacity development and training of UNCT members. • Gender equality pilot projects. • Support to national women's machinery. • Support to women's NGOs and networks. • Maintenance of experts' roster. • Gender mainstreaming in CCA/ UNDAF exercises (e.g. for the preparation of background	Needs improvement (Score: 3) CDP Annual Work Plans (AWP) included specific activities and budgetary allocations for the following initiatives: • Support to national women's machinery. • Support to women's NGOs and networks. • UNKT: Gender mainstreaming in CCA/ UNDAF exercises (e.g. for the preparation of background documentation, gender analysis capacity building, technical resource persons,

Dimensions	Definition	Rating Include reviewer comments and evidence base
	documentation, gender analysis capacity building, technical resource persons, etc.). Meets minimum standard Specific budgets allocated for any four of the above. Needs improvement Specific budgets allocated for any three of the above. Inadequate Specific budget allocated for one or two of the above. Missing Not applicable	etc.). The first two initiatives were more agency specific while the last initiative was a joint UNKT initiative Evidence: CDP Annual Work Plans Interviews with UN Agencies
7. MONITORING AND EVALUATION		
7.a - Monitoring and evaluation includes adequate attention to gender mainstreaming and the promotion of gender equality and women's empowerment Source: UNDG Guidance	Exceeds minimum standard • A dedicated gender equality evaluation is carried out once during the UNDAF period. • Gender audit undertaken once during UNDAF period. • The UNDAF Monitoring and Evaluation Framework measures gender-related outcome and output expected results. • Data for gender-sensitive indicators in the UNDAF Results Matrix is gathered as planned. • All monitoring and evaluation data is sex-disaggregated, or there is a specific reason noted for not disaggregating by sex. • The UNDAF Annual Review reports on the main gender-related expected results. • Resident Coordinator reporting covers the main gender-related expected results. • Gaps against planned results are rectified at an early stage. Meets minimum standard • The UNDAF Monitoring and Evaluation Framework measures gender-related outcome and output expected results. • Data for gender-sensitive indicators in the UNDAF Results Matrix is gathered as planned. • All monitoring and evaluation data is sex-disaggregated, or there is a specific reason noted for not disaggregating by sex. • The UNDAF/CAP Annual Review reports on the main gender-related expected results.	Meets minimum standard (Score: 4) The CDP M&E Framework measures gender related outcomes and outputs. Data for gender sensitive indicators in the M&E Framework is also gathered. All the data in the M&E framework (where there is no specific reason not to disaggregate) is sex disaggregated, and the annual reporting from the Resident Coordinator covers the main gender related results. However, since there is no a dedicated gender equality evaluation carried out or a gender audit undertaken the “exceed minimum standard” rating is not given Evidence: CDP M&E Framework, Annual reporting from RC

Dimensions	Definition	Rating Include reviewer comments and evidence base
	Resident Coordinator reporting covers the main gender-related expected results. Needs improvement Any four of the above (under <i>Meets minimum standard</i>) are achieved. Inadequate Less than four of the above (under <i>Meets minimum standard</i>) are achieved. Missing Not applicable	
8. QUALITY CONTROL AND ACCOUNTABILITY		
8.a - CCA/UNDAF quality control¹² Source: UNDG Guidance	Exceeds minimum standards - Gender experts involved in all aspects of CCA/UNDAF preparation. - Readers' Group comments refer specifically to gender equality and empowerment of women. - Evidence of changes based on Readers' Group comments concerning gender equality and empowerment of women. - Relevant assessment on gender equality and empowerment of women from the CCA quality review template taken into account in revising the CCA/. - Relevant assessment on gender equality and empowerment of women from the UNDAF quality review template taken into account in revising the UNDAF. Meets minimum standard - Gender experts involved in all aspects of CCA/UNDAF preparation. - Relevant assessment on gender equality and empowerment of women from the CCA quality review template taken into account in revising the CCA. - Relevant assessment on gender equality and empowerment of women from the UNDAF quality review template taken into account in revising the UNDAF. Needs improvement	Needs improvement: (Score: 3) Gender specialist from UNDP and Un Women involved in all aspects of UNKT preparation and the draft of the CDP underwent a critical/analytical reading by gender experts in order to have sufficient recommendations that guarantee the incorporation of the approach in CDP. Since Kosovo did not follow proper UNDAF process other requirements foreseen were not applicable for Kosovo. Evidence base: Interviews

¹² To be completed once during the CCA/UNDAF process.

Dimensions	Definition	Rating Include reviewer comments and evidence base
	Meets only one or two of the above (under <i>Meets minimum standard</i>). Inadequate Token attention to gender equality during review and quality control exercises. Missing Not applicable	

Annex 2: Note the documents reviewed

Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women, General Assembly Resolution 34/180 of 18 December 1979

Government of Kosovo, Action Plan of the Economic Vision of Kosovo

Government of Kosovo, Action Plan for Implementation of UNSR 1325 on Women, Peace and Security

Joint Programme on Diaspora Engagement in Economic Development (2012), UNDP & IOM

Joint Programme on Support to Addressing Gender Based Violence in Kosovo (2011), UNFPA, UN Women, UNICEF, OHCHR, UNDP

Joint Programme on Parliamentary Development for Social Policies (2011), UNDP, UNICEF, WHO, UNFPA, OHCHR

Joint Programme on Building a Better Future for Citizens of Fushe Kosove/Kosov Polje and Obiliq/Obilic (2012), UNDP, UNICEF, UNFPA, WHO

Joint Programme on Women, Peace and Security (2012), EU, UNDP, UN Women

Kosovo Programme for Gender Equality (2008 -2013)

Law on Gender Equality (Law No. 2004/2)

Security and Gender Coordination Group, Together Towards Gender Responsive Security

United Nations Kosovo Team (2011), Common Development Plan 2011 – 2015

United Nations Kosovo Team, Common Development Plan 2011 – 2015, Monitoring and Evaluation Framework

United Nations Kosovo Team, Common Development Plan 2011 – 2015 Annual Work Plans

United Nations Kosovo Team (2010), MDG Report for Kosovo

United Nations Kosovo Team & OHCHR (2013), Healing the Spirit, Reparations for Survivors of Sexual Violence Related to the Armed Conflict in Kosovo

UN Heads of Agencies Meeting, Minutes of the Meeting

UNDP & UN Women (2013), Mapping for Local Initiatives on Women, Peace and Security in Kosovo 1999- 2012

Annex 3: The names and institutional positions of those interviewed.

Name	Title / Organizations
Abdullah Kryeziu	Joint Programme Coordinator,
Ardian Spahiu	Joint Programme Coordinator
Bajram Maxhuni	Joint Programme Coordinator,
Brikena Sylejmani	Gender Specialist, UNDP
Flora Macula	Head of UN Women in Kosovo
Laura Fragiaco	UNICEF Gender Focal Point
Lavdim Krasniqi	Head of Kosovo Judicial Institute
Luljeta Vuniki	Head of Kosovo Gender Study Centre
Nita Gojani	Project Coordination, UN Women
Nora Sahatciu	UN Coordination Specialist, UNKT
Selim Selimi	Joint Programme Coordinator, UNDP
Shpend Qamili	UN Communication Specialist, UNKT
Shpresa Agushi	Head of RAE Network
Tahire Haxholli	Captain, Kosovo Police
Taibe Canolli	Head of Women Police Association
Valbona Salihu	Head of Norma (women) lawyers association
Yllka Plana	UN Coordination Office, UNKT